

Trademark Protection and Freedom of Expression

An Inquiry into the Conflict between Trademark
Rights and Freedom of Expression under European Law

Wolfgang Sakulin

Information Law Series

VOLUME 22

General Editor

Prof. P. Bernt Hugenholtz
Institute for Information Law
University of Amsterdam

The titles published in this series are listed at the back of this volume.

Published by:
Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:
Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:
Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3415-8

© Wolfgang Sakulin, Rotterdam 2010, c/o Kluwer Law International, Alphen aan den Rijn, The Netherlands.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to:
Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY
10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain.

Table of Contents

Preface and Acknowledgement	v
List of Abbreviations	xv
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
1.1. Trademark Protection versus Freedom of Expression: Introduction to a Possible Conflict	1
1.2. The Evolution of the Conflict Over Trademark Use	5
1.2.1. Key Elements of the Conflict	5
1.2.1.1. Two Basic Functions of Trademarks	5
1.2.1.2. The Idiosyncrasy of Trademarks	6
1.2.1.3. Monologic and Dialogic Communication	6
1.2.2. Trademarks as Identifiers	8
1.2.3. A Change in Advertising Paradigms: From Identifiers to Communicators	9
1.2.4. Emergence of a Political Dimension to the Conflict	12
1.2.5. Emergence of a Social and Cultural Dimension of the Conflict	14
1.2.6. Conflicts in the New Media	15
1.3. Research Question and Outline	16
1.4. Limitation of the Subject Matter	21
1.5. A Comparative Perspective	22
Chapter 2	
Trademark Rights and Their Rationales	25
2.1. Introduction	25
2.2. A Bird's-Eye View of European Trademark Law	26

Table of Contents

2.2.1.	The European Trademark Law Framework	26
2.2.2.	The Grant and Revocation of Trademark Rights	28
2.2.2.1.	Grounds for Refusal of Registration	30
2.2.2.2.	Revocation of Registration	33
2.2.3.	The Scope of Trademark Rights	33
2.2.3.1.	Identity Protection and Protection against Confusing Use	33
2.2.3.1.1.	'Identity Protection' under Article 5.1.a TMDir	34
2.2.3.1.2.	Protection against Confusion under Article 5.1.b TMDir	35
2.2.3.2.	Protection of the Distinctive Character and Repute	36
2.2.3.2.1.	Use in Relation to Goods and Services	36
2.2.3.2.2.	Free-Riding, Blurring, and Tarnishment	37
2.2.3.2.3.	Article 5.5 TMDir	39
2.2.4.	Limitations of Trademark Rights	40
2.3.	Rationales for the Grant and Scope of Trademark Rights	41
2.3.1.	Trademark Functions in Trade	43
2.3.1.1.	Source Identification Function	43
2.3.1.2.	Product Distinction Function	44
2.3.1.3.	Quality or Guarantee Function	45
2.3.1.4.	Goodwill and Advertising Function	46
2.3.1.5.	The 'Essential Function' of Trademarks as Viewed by the ECJ	49
2.3.2.	Economic Rationales	51
2.3.2.1.	Background	52
2.3.2.2.	Lowered Search-Costs and Dynamic Efficiency	53
2.3.2.3.	Protection of the Goodwill and Advertising Function	57
2.3.2.3.1.	Lowered Search Costs	58
2.3.2.3.2.	Dynamic Efficiency	60
2.3.2.3.3.	Trademarks as Psychological Commodities	61
2.3.2.3.4.	'Perception Advertising' and Negative Effects on Rationality	63
2.3.2.4.	Interim Conclusion	66
2.3.3.	Ethical and Fairness-Based Rationales	67
2.3.3.1.	Unfair Competition and the Underlying Principles of Truth and Unjust Enrichment	68
2.3.3.2.	Truthfulness	69

Table of Contents

2.3.3.3.	Unjust Enrichment as a Principle	71
2.3.3.4.	An Extended Version of Lockean Labour Rationale	75
2.3.3.2.1.	Protection of the Goodwill and Advertising Function	76
2.3.3.2.2.	Limitations	78
2.3.3.5.	Interim Conclusion	79
2.4.	Trademark Rights in Light of the Rationales	80
2.4.1.	The Grant and Revocation of Trademark Rights	80
2.4.1.1.	Grounds for Refusal of Registration	82
2.4.1.2.	Revocation of Registration	83
2.4.2.	Identity Protection and Protection against Confusing Use	85
2.4.2.1.	Identity Protection	85
2.4.2.2.	Protection against Confusion	86
2.4.2.3.	Level of Proof for the Protection against Confusion	87
2.4.3.	Protection of Distinctive Character and Repute	88
2.4.3.1.	The Definition of ‘Reputation’	89
2.4.3.2.	Use in Relation to Goods and Services	91
2.4.3.3.	Taking Unfair Advantage	92
2.4.3.4.	Blurring	97
2.4.3.5.	Tarnishment	99
2.4.3.6.	Article 5.5 TMDir	100
2.4.4.	Limitations of Trademark Rights	101
2.5.	Conclusion	104

Chapter 3

Freedom of Expression as a Possible Limitation to Trademark Rights	109	
3.1.	Introduction	109
3.2.	A Bird’s- Eye View of the Provisions Protecting Freedom of Expression	111
3.2.1.	Article 10 ECHR	111
3.2.2.	Freedom of Expression under EU Law	113
3.2.3.	Freedom of Expression under United Kingdom Law	115
3.2.4.	Freedom of Expression under Dutch Law	115
3.2.5.	Article 5 of the German Grundgesetz	117
3.3.	Invoking Freedom of Expression in a Conflict with Trademark Rights	119
3.3.1.	Indirect Horizontal Effect of Article 10 ECHR	120
3.3.1.1.	Indirect Horizontal Effect and Positive Obligations	121
3.3.1.2.	Positive Obligations and Expressive Diversity	122

Table of Contents

3.3.2.	Horizontal Effect of Article 10 ECHR in EU Law	123
3.3.3.	<i>Horizontale Doorwerking</i> in the Dutch Legal Order	124
3.3.4.	Horizontal Effect in the United Kingdom	125
3.3.5.	<i>Mittelbare Drittwirkung</i> of Article 5 GG	126
3.3.6.	The Constitutionalisation of Private Law	128
3.4.	Rationales for Freedom of Expression	130
3.4.1.	General Rationales for Freedom of Non-Commercial Expression	131
3.4.1.1.	Truth, Democracy, and the Role of the State	131
3.4.1.1.1.	Discovering Truth	132
3.4.1.1.2.	Democracy and Control of Power	133
3.4.1.1.3.	Minority Views, Opposition, Exaggeration, and Pluralism	134
3.4.1.1.4.	Limitations	136
3.4.1.2.	The Self-Fulfilment of Individuals	137
3.4.2.	Dialogic Democracy: A Supplementary Rationale for the Use of Trademarks in Non-Commercial Expression	138
3.4.3.	The Rationale for Freedom of Commercial Expression	142
3.4.4.	Interim Conclusion	147
3.5.	The Varying Level of Protection	149
3.5.1.	Non-Commercial Expression	150
3.5.1.1.	Expression on Matters of Public Interest	150
3.5.1.2.	Public Figures and Public Symbols	152
3.5.1.2.1.	Public Figures and Public Symbols	153
3.5.1.2.2.	The Countervailing Interests	155
3.5.1.3.	Artistic Expression	159
3.5.1.4.	Chilling Effects on Public Discourse	163
3.5.2.	Purely Commercial Expression	166
3.5.3.	Mixed-Expression	168
3.5.3.1.	Article 10 ECHR	169
3.5.3.2.	Article 5 GG	174
3.6.	Conclusion	175
Chapter 4		
Balancing the Grant and Revocation of Trademark Rights with Freedom of Expression		
4.1	Introduction	181
4.1.1	General Introduction	181
4.1.2	The Public Interest Stemming from Freedom of Expression	182
4.1.3	Outline	187
4.2	The Grant of Trademark Rights and the Grounds for Refusal	189

Table of Contents

4.2.1	The Need for a Critical Assessment at the Time of Registration	189
4.2.2	Ground for Refusal I: Descriptiveness	192
4.2.2.1	Criteria Found in the Jurisprudence of ECJ and CFI	193
4.2.2.2	Extending the Notion of Descriptiveness Even Further	199
4.2.3	Ground for Refusal II: Customariness	203
4.2.4	Ground for Refusal III: Non-Distinctiveness	204
4.2.4.1	Room for Interpretation in Line with Freedom of Expression	205
4.2.4.2	Laudatory Signs and Slogans	208
4.2.4.3	Signs of High Social, Cultural, or Political Value	211
4.2.5	Limitation of the Previous Grounds for Refusal: Acquired Distinctiveness	215
4.2.5.1	Test and Evidence	216
4.2.5.2	De Jure (Partial) Exclusion from Acquiring Distinctiveness	218
4.2.6	Grounds for Refusal of Bad Faith and Public Order	220
4.2.6.1	Bad Faith	221
4.2.6.2	Public Order and Public Policy	222
4.3	The Ground for Revocation for Generic Trademarks	224
4.4	Conclusion	227
Chapter 5		
Balancing the Scope of Trademark Rights with Freedom of Expression		231
5.1.	Introduction	231
5.1.1.	General Introduction	231
5.1.2.	The Freedom of Expression at Stake	232
5.1.3.	Outline	235
5.2.	Balancing by Interpreting the Constitutive Criteria of the Scope	237
5.2.1.	The Limitation of Trademark Rights to Use in the Course of Trade	237
5.2.1.1.	Jurisprudence of the ECJ	238
5.2.1.2.	United Kingdom Trade Marks Act	239
5.2.1.3.	The German Markengesetz	240
5.2.1.4.	Benelux Convention on Intellectual Property (BVIE)	242
5.2.1.5.	Interim Conclusion	245

Table of Contents

5.2.2.	Identity-Protection and Protection against Confusion	246
5.2.2.1.	Freedom of Commercial Expression and Confusion	247
5.2.2.1.1.	Use in Relation to Goods and Services under Article 5.1 TMDir	248
5.2.2.1.2.	Likelihood of Confusion	250
5.2.2.2.	Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression	254
5.2.2.2.1.	Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression of Third Parties	254
5.2.2.2.2.	Interpretative Protection of Expressive Diversity	255
5.2.2.3.	Interim Conclusion	260
5.2.3.	The Protection of Distinctive Character and Repute	260
5.2.3.1.	Use in Relation to Similar and Dissimilar Goods and Services	263
5.2.3.1.1.	Use under the Warenzeichengesetz	264
5.2.3.1.2.	Use under the Markengesetz	265
5.2.3.2.	Taking Advantage of the Distinctive Character or Repute (Free-Riding)	267
5.2.3.2.1.	Freedom of Commercial Expression	268
5.2.3.2.2.	Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression	270
5.2.3.3.	Detriment to the Distinctive Character or Repute (Blurring and Tarnishment)	273
5.2.3.3.1.	Freedom of Commercial Expression	274
5.2.3.3.2.	Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression	275
5.2.3.4.	Article 5.5 TMDir and the Benelux Experience	277
5.2.3.5.	Interim Conclusion	280
5.3.	Balancing under the Limitations to the Scope	282
5.3.1.	Rejection of an ‘Alternative Means of Expression’ or Necessity Test	283
5.3.1.1.	The Necessity Test for Referential Use and Due Cause	284

Table of Contents

5.3.1.2.	Article 10.2 ECHR	285
5.3.1.2.1.	Freedom of Commercial Expression	286
5.3.1.2.2.	Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression	287
5.3.1.3.	Interim Conclusion	288
5.3.2.	Balancing with Freedom of Commercial Expression	288
5.3.2.1.	Confusion	289
5.3.2.1.1.	Descriptive Use	289
5.3.2.1.2.	Referential Use and Comparative Advertising	292
5.3.2.2.	Taking Unfair Advantage (Free-Riding)	293
5.3.2.3.	Blurring and Generic Use	296
5.3.2.4.	Tarnishment, Discrediting Use, and Denigration	297
5.3.2.5.	Interim Conclusion to Freedom of Commercial Expression	298
5.3.3.	Balancing with Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression	300
5.3.3.1.	Assessing Commerciality in Mixed Expression	301
5.3.3.1.1.	Balancing under European Trademark Law	301
5.3.3.1.2.	A Non-Commercial Use Exception	306
5.3.3.2.	Descriptive Use, Generic Use, and Expressive Diversity	309
5.3.3.2.1.	(Expressively) Descriptive and Generic Use	309
5.3.3.2.2.	Expressive Diversity	313
5.3.3.3.	Use of Trademarks in ‘Meaning Making’ and a Possible Parody Exception	314
5.3.3.3.1.	Examples of Meaning Making in Art, Parody, and Criticism	315
5.3.3.3.2.	A Parody Exception for Trademark Law?	317
5.3.3.4.	Balancing Harm with Freedom of Expression	320
5.3.3.4.1.	Awareness Campaigns	321
5.3.3.4.2.	The Criticism of Individuals	323
5.3.3.4.3.	Balancing in Extreme Cases	325
5.4.	Chilling Effects	327
5.5.	Conclusion	329

Table of Contents

Chapter 6	
Summary and Recommendations	337
6.1 Summary	337
6.2 Recommendations	345
Annex	353
Bibliography	359
Table of Cases	381